

CRAVATH, SWAINE & MOORE LLP

WORLDWIDE PLAZA  
825 EIGHTH AVENUE  
NEW YORK, NY 10019-7475

TELEPHONE: +1-212-474-1000  
FACSIMILE: +1-212-474-3700

CITYPOINT  
ONE ROPEMAKER STREET  
LONDON EC2Y 9HR  
TELEPHONE: +44-20-7453-1000  
FACSIMILE: +44-20-7860-1150

WRITER'S DIRECT DIAL NUMBER

(212) 474-1243

GEORGE E. ZOBITZ  
GEORGE A. STEPHANAKIS  
DARIN P. MCATEE  
GARY A. BORNSTEIN  
TIMOTHY G. CAMERON  
KARIN A. DEMASI  
LIZABETHANN R. EISEN  
DAVID S. FINKELSTEIN  
DAVID GREENWALD  
RACHEL G. SKAISTIS  
PAUL H. ZUMBRO  
JOEL F. HEROLD  
ERIC W. HILFERS  
GEORGE F. SCHOEN  
ERIK R. TAVZEL  
CRAIG F. ARCELLA  
TEENA-ANN V. SANKOORIKAL  
ANDREW R. THOMPSON  
DAMIEN R. ZOUBEK  
LAUREN ANGELILLI  
TATIANA LAPUSHCHIK  
ERIC L. SCHIELE  
ALYSSA K. CAPLES  
JENNIFER S. CONWAY  
MINH VAN NGO

KEVIN J. ORSINI  
MATTHEW MORREALE  
JOHN D. BURETTA  
J. WESLEY EARNHARDT  
YONATAN EVEN  
BENJAMIN GRUENSTEIN  
JOSEPH D. ZAVAGLIA  
STEPHEN M. KESSING  
LAUREN A. MOSKOWITZ  
DAVID J. PERKINS  
JOHNNY G. SKUMPIJA  
J. LEONARD TETI, II  
D. SCOTT BENNETT  
TING S. CHEN  
CHRISTOPHER K. FARGO  
KENNETH C. HALCOM  
DAVID M. STUART  
  
SPECIAL COUNSEL  
SAMUEL C. BUTLER  
GEORGE J. GILLESPIE, III  
  
OF COUNSEL  
PAUL C. SAUNDERS

STUART W. GOLD  
JOHN W. WHITE  
EVAN R. CHESLER  
MICHAEL L. SCHLER  
RICHARD LEVIN  
KRIS F. HEINZELMAN  
B. ROBBINS KIESSLING  
ROGER D. TURNER  
PHILIP A. GELSTON  
RORY O. MILLSON  
FRANCIS P. BARRON  
RICHARD W. CLARY  
WILLIAM P. ROGERS, JR.  
JAMES D. COOPER  
STEPHEN L. GORDON  
DANIEL L. MOSLEY  
JAMES C. VARDELL, III  
ROBERT H. BARON  
KEVIN J. GREHAN  
C. ALLEN PARKER  
SUSAN WEBSTER  
DAVID MERCADO  
ROWAN D. WILSON  
CHRISTINE A. VARNEY  
PETER T. BARBUR

SANDRA C. GOLDSTEIN  
THOMAS G. RAFFERTY  
MICHAEL S. GOLDMAN  
RICHARD HALL  
JULIE A. NORTH  
ANDREW W. NEEDHAM  
STEPHEN L. BURNS  
KEITH R. HUMMEL  
DAVID J. KAPPOS  
DANIEL SLIFKIN  
ROBERT I. TOWNSEND, III  
WILLIAM J. WHELAN, III  
SCOTT A. BARSHAY  
PHILIP J. BOECKMAN  
ROGER G. BROOKS  
WILLIAM V. FOGG  
FAIZA J. SAEED  
RICHARD J. STARK  
THOMAS E. DUNN  
MARK I. GREENE  
DAVID R. MARRIOTT  
MICHAEL A. PASKIN  
ANDREW J. PITTS  
MICHAEL T. REYNOLDS  
ANTONY L. RYAN

September 9, 2014

United States ex rel. Kester v. Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corp.  
No. 11 Civ. 8196 (CM)

Dear Judge McMahon:

We represent defendant Novartis Pharmaceuticals Corporation ("NPC") in the above-referenced matter. A discovery dispute has arisen among the parties, and I write in accordance with Rule IV.B. of Your Honor's Individual Rules (as revised November 26, 2013) to request an order of reference to Magistrate Judge Francis.

We appreciate the Court's consideration of this request.

Respectfully,



Evan R. Chesler

Hon. Colleen McMahon  
United States District Judge  
Southern District of New York  
500 Pearl Street, Room 1640  
New York, NY 10007

VIA ECF

Copies to:

Li Yu, Esq.

Rebecca C. Martin, Esq.

Ellen M. London, Esq.

Tara Marie La Morte, Esq.

Robert W. Yalen, Esq.

United States Attorney's Office

86 Chambers Street

New York, NY 10007

David B. Zlotnick, Esq.

Nicholas N. Paul, Esq.

Steven U. Ross, Esq.

California Attorney General's Office

Bureau of Medi-Cal Fraud and Elder Abuse

1455 Frazee Road, Suite 315

San Diego, CA 92108

Rachel Coles, Esq.

Office of the Attorney General

1300 I Street

Sacramento, CA 95814

Elizabeth White, Esq.

Georgia Attorney General's Office

200 Piedmont Avenue, SE

West Tower, 19th Floor

Atlanta, GA 30334

Clemon D. Ashley, Esq.

Assistant Attorney General

Illinois Attorney General Office

Medicaid Fraud Control Unit

100 W. Randolph Street, 12th Floor

Chicago, IL 60601

Lawrence Joseph Carcare II, Esq.

Office of Indiana Attorney General

302 W. Washington Street, IGCS – 5th Floor

Indianapolis, IN 46204

Jeremy Dykes, Esq.

Maryland Attorney General

200 St. Paul Plaza

Baltimore, MD 21202

Deborah J. Harper, Esq.  
Assistant Attorney General  
Health Care Fraud Division  
2860 Eyde Parkway  
East Lansing, MI 48823

Christopher P. Robinson, Esq.  
Niki S. Batt, Esq.  
Assistant Attorney General  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
Oklahoma Office of Attorney General  
313 NE 21st Street  
Oklahoma City, OK 73105

Katie M. Wilson, Esq.  
Assistant Attorney General  
Wisconsin Department of Justice  
P.O. Box 7857  
Madison, WI 53707

Christopher Yates Miller, Esq.  
Diana Elkind, Esq.  
New York State Office of the Attorney General  
120 Broadway  
New York, NY 10271

Carrie L. Bashaw, Esq.  
Douglas D. Walsh, Esq.  
Michelle M. Teed, Esq.  
Paul F. James, Esq.  
Steve E. Dietrich, Esq.  
Washington State Attorney General's Office  
Medicaid Fraud Control Unit  
P.O. Box 40114  
Olympia, WA 98504

Robert Lawrence Vogel, Esq.  
Janet Lyn Goldstein, Esq.  
Shelley R. Slade, Esq.  
Vogel, Slade & Goldstein, LLP  
1718 Connecticut Avenue NW, 7th Floor  
Washington, DC 20009

William C. Carmody, Esq.  
Arun S. Subramanian, Esq.  
Steven M. Shepard, Esq.  
Susman Godfrey LLP  
560 Lexington Avenue, 15th Floor  
New York, NY 10022

Kristin Malone, Esq.  
Susman Godfrey LLP  
1201 Third Avenue, Suite 3800  
Seattle, WA 98101

Shawn Raymond, Esq.  
Susman Godfrey LLP  
1000 Louisiana, Suite 5100  
Houston, TX 77002

Jonathan Bridges, Esq.  
Susman Godfrey LLP  
901 Main Street, Suite 5100  
Dallas, TX 75202

Allen M. Gardner, Esq.  
Daniel Meron, Esq.  
Latham & Watkins LLP  
555 Eleventh Street, NW, Suite 1000  
Washington, DC 20004

Amanda M. MacDonald, Esq.  
Enu A. Mainigi, Esq.  
Nicholas F. Gamse, Esq.  
Williams & Connolly LLP  
725 Twelfth Street NW  
Washington, DC 20005

Manvin Singh Mayell, Esq.  
Michael A. Rogoff, Esq.  
Kaye Scholer LLP  
425 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10022

Faith E. Gay, Esq.  
Manisha M. Sheth, Esq.  
Quinn Emanuel Urquhart & Sullivan LLP  
51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor  
New York, NY 10010

VIA ECF